

**Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes**

January 16, 2018

Members Present: Sharon Hairston, Jointly Held Committee Chair, Board Vice President
Adrienne Heard, RTA Board President, Acting Planning Committee
Chair

Vince Corrado
John Lumpkin, Chair, Finance/Personnel Committee
Belinda Matthews Stenson

Excused Absence: Franz Hoge
Sharon Howard, Chair, Planning Committee
Tom U. Weckesser
David Williamson, Chair, Investment Advisory

Staff in Attendance: Mark Donaghy
Daron Brown
Roland Caldwell
Joyce Carter
Tim Harrington
Deborah Howard
Nikol Miller
Brandon Policicchio
Bob Ruzinsky
Mary K. Stanforth
Robert Thomas

Others Attending: Dr. Richard Henry, League of Women Voters

Call to Order

Ms. Sharon Hairston called the meeting to order at 8:34 a.m. A quorum was present and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of December 19, 2017 Meeting Minutes

Ms. Hairston asked if attendees desired a reading of the minutes or if there were any corrections to the minutes? No requests to read the minutes or corrections were made. Ms. Hairston APPROVED the December 19, 2017 meeting minutes.

Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority

February 2018 Board Action Items:

Action Item #2 – Purchase of Engine Lubricating Oil

Mr. Daron Brown stated that the purpose of this procurement is to purchase engine lubricating oil for the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) for the diesel fleet. Engine lubricating oil is used on a daily basis by the Maintenance Department as part of preventive maintenance of the diesel fleet. This project is consistent with RTA’s core values of Safety and Stewardship as we work to continuously maintain RTA’s fleet in excellent condition.

On November 20, 2017, sealed bids for the Purchase of Engine Lubricating Oil were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News* and *Transit Talent*. Invitations for Bid were sent to forty three (43) firms and one (1) plan house. At 2:00 p.m., on December 14, 2017, twelve (12) bids were received and publicly opened. The results are as follows:

	Vendor	Year One Unit Price Per Gallon	Year Two Unit Price Per Gallon	Year Three Unit Price Per Gallon	Years 1-3 Total Amount (Est. 12,000 gallons per year)	Manufacturer	Product Name
1.	Apollo Lubricants, LLC Winchester, KY	4.85	4.75	4.65	171,000	Valvoline	All-Fleet Plus E900 15W40
2.	Northeast Lubricants Cleveland, OH	5.17	5.37	5.57	193,320	Warren Unilube	Lubriguard 15W40 SB
3.	Glockner Oil Co. Piketon, OH	5.18	5.43	5.68	195,480	Warren	Service Pro Syn Blend 15W40
4.	Vidatt Energy Inc. Cincinnati, OH	5.33	5.44	5.68	197,400	Phillips 66	Fleet Supreme EC Diesel Engine Oil
5.	Petro Choice Mason, OH	5.28	5.58	6.08	203,280	Pinnacle Oil	Fleet Pro Elite 15W40
6.	Acculube Dayton, OH	5.86	5.86	5.86	210,960	Exxon Mobil	Mobil HDEO 15W40
7.	The Dayton Parts Co. Dayton, OH	6.10	6.10	6.10	219,600	Citgo Petroleum	Mile Master CK4 15W40
8.	R.D. Holder Oil Co. New Carlisle, OH	6.12	6.41	6.71	230,880	Total Specialties USA	Rubia Optima 1100 15W40 CK4
9.	Reladyne Cincinnati, OH	6.17	6.42	6.67	231,120	Phillips 66	Fleet Supreme EC 15W40
10.	Heritage Petroleum Evansville, IN	6.43	6.43	6.43	231,480	Phillips 66	Fleet Supreme EC 15W40
11.	Safety-Kleen Systems Inc. Richardson, TX	6.50	6.65	6.80	239,400	Safety-Kleen Performance Plus	HDDEO 15W40 CK4 (3102134)
12.	Rely Supply, LLC Cincinnati, OH	6.43	6.65	6.94	240,240	Phillips 66	Fleet Supreme EC 15W40

Mr. Corrado asked how current oil costs compare to the recommend vendors price. Mr. Brown stated that RTA will be paying \$2.00 less per gallon. Mr. Corrado also asked about the quality of the oil. Mr. Brown stated that it is high quality and recommended by the engine manufacturer.

MOTION made by Mr. Corrado and SECONDED by Ms. Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Apollo Oil, LLC for the Purchase of Engine Lubricating Oil based on an estimated usage of 12,000 gallons per year for three (3) years totaling \$171,000. The actual award amount will vary based upon usage. This procurement is funded through operating funds. The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 5-0.

Action Item #3 – Legal Services

Ms. Stanforth stated that the Greater Dayton RTA solicited proposals for Legal Services for General and Corporate Affairs, Labor, Workers' Compensation, EEO, Miscellaneous, Litigation and Settlement. This falls under the Core Value of Stewardship.

On October 26, 2017, proposals were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News; Dayton Weekly News and Transit Talent*. Requests for proposals were sent to forty-three (43) firms.

At 2:00 p.m., on November 20, 2017, nine (9) proposals were received. The proposals were reviewed by the Evaluation Committee based upon the following criteria:

Evaluation Criteria

- Proven experience and staffing resources to carry out a multitude of litigation action in the public sector, including a regional transit organization
Other than a law degree, identify any special training or knowledge that staff possesses
- Experience associated with labor, collection, EEO, and claims law for counsel assigned to RTA
Staff expertise and whether the lawyer is a veteran or beginner, special knowledge and management of cases
- Comprehensiveness of firm's available legal services
Clearly state the areas of law your firm proposes providing
- Reasonableness of cost
Describe attorney fees, associated costs and how are they billed; will a portion or all of RTA's cases be handled by paralegals or legal assistants and what are their fees
- What is your firm's philosophy?
Describe your firm's guiding principles
- Overall history and background to include references
References should pertain to the type of services contained in the scope of work
- Quality of proposal presentation
The firm's capabilities should be clearly demonstrated in the proposal; proposal should be organized as requested with Table of Contents along with numbered pages

Following are the results of the proposals received from firms interested in providing these services.

	<u>Firm</u>	<u>Years</u>	<u>Hourly Rate</u>	<u>Hourly Rate Paralegal</u>	<u>Services</u>
1.	Baker & Hostetler LLP Columbus, OH	Year 1 Year 2 Option Years 3, 4 and 5 Years 1 and 2; Option Year 3 Option Years 4 and 5	\$245 255 265 265 \$15,000 19,000 \$16,000 20,000	\$125 125 130 135 	Labor and Workers' Compensation Associate Counsel for EEO Flat fee arrangement Contract interpretations Discipline/discharge Contract interpretations Discipline/discharge
2.	Coolidge Wall Co., L.P.A. Dayton, OH	Years 1 and 2 Option Years 3, 4 and 5	\$200 220	\$140 154	General and Corporate Affairs, EEO and Miscellaneous, Litigation and Settlement; Workers' Compensation and Labor
3.	Taft Stettinius & Hollister, LLP Dayton, OH				*
4.	Hollingsworth & Washington, LLC Dayton, OH				*
5.	Auman, Mahan & Furry Dayton, OH				*
6.	Mazanec, Ruskin & Ryder Co., L.P.A Columbus, OH				*
7.	Roetzel & Andress, LPA Akron, OH				*
8.	Porter Wright Morris & Arthur LLP Dayton, OH				*
9.	Pickrel, Schaeffer and Ebeling Dayton, OH				*

* FTA Procurement guidelines require that only the successful proposers pricing data be disclosed publicly.

A total of \$502,497 has been appropriated for all legal services for 2018. Estimated amounts will be budgeted for legal services each year thereafter and appropriated annually by the Board of Trustees.

Ms. Stenson asked how current firm rates compare to the recommended firms. Ms. Stanforth stated that each are comparable in the first year, but in outer years, the recommended firms are more cost effective.

Mr. Lumpkin asked if there were any issues with the services provided by the current law firm Hollingsworth & Washington, LLC. Ms. Stanforth stated that there are no known issues with the current firm. Mr. Donaghy stated that the RTA is required to go out to bid every five (5) years for professional services.

MOTION made by Ms. Heard and SECONDED by Mr. Corrado that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Baker & Hostetler and Coolidge Wall Co. for a total of \$502,497 that has been appropriated for all legal services for 2018. Estimated amounts will be budgeted for legal services each year thereafter and appropriated annually by the Board of Trustees. The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 4-1. Mr. Lumpkin opposed the motion.

Action Item #4 - State of Ohio Audit Service Fees

Ms. Stanforth explained that during 2018 the Ohio Auditor of State will perform Audit Services for the Greater Dayton RTA. Based upon the previous two (2) years, Staff estimates a total cost for services not-to-exceed \$40,000. The fees relate to the 2017 Financial Statements Audit as well as Agreed Upon Procedures for RTA's 2017 National Transit Database Report.

MOTION made by Ms. Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of a not-to-exceed amount of \$40,000 to the Treasurer of the State of Ohio for 2017 Audit Service Fees. The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 5-0.

Informational and Discussion Items:

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio previously included in today's meeting packet a summary document of recent activities in the Customer and Business Development Department. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

KPI Data Review

KPI data was previously included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

October 2017 Sales Tax Update

Mr. Thomas reported October 2017 Sales Tax receipts equal \$2,956,538 and State of Ohio Transitional Aid is \$383,788. The Grand Total of \$3,340,326 reflects a 3.6% or \$115,000 increase versus October 2016.

Year-to-Date (YTD) October 2017 Sales Tax receipts equal \$32,820,297 and State of Ohio Transitional Aid is \$1,535,151. The YTD Grand Total of \$34,355,448 reflects a 0.8% or \$269,000 increase versus YTD October 2016. As compared to YTD Budget, we see a \$1.2 Million shortfall.

December 2017 Financial Statements

The details associated with the December 2017 financial statements were not available for the Committee Meeting. Ms. Stanforth stated that December 2017 statements will be ready for the February 20, 2018 Committees Meeting.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Deborah Howard stated Small Purchasing Information was previously included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

Next Meeting Dates

A Jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting will be held on February 20, 2018 and March 21, 2018. Meetings will start promptly at 8:30 a.m.

Adjournment

MOTION made by Mr. Corrado and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin to ADJOURN the meeting. The motion was APPROVED by voice vote 5-0. The meeting adjourned at 9:07 a.m.

Attest



Sharon Hairston, Chair



Brandon Policicchio, Committee Secretary