

Jointly Held  
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees  
Meeting Minutes

May 21, 2019

**Members Present:** David Williamson, Jointly Held Committee Chair  
Vince Corrado  
Sharon Hairston  
Adrienne Heard  
Franz Hoge  
Sharon Howard (arrived 8:47am)  
John Lumpkin  
Belinda Matthews Stenson  
Tom U. Weckesser (arrived 8:33am)

**Staff in Attendance:** Mark Donaghy  
Julia Beard  
Chris Cole  
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall Co., L.P.A.  
Joy DesLauriers-Davis  
Arthur "Skip" Dunkle  
Tim Harrington  
Deborah Howard  
Brandon Policicchio  
Bob Ruzinsky  
Mary K. Stanforth  
Robert Stevens  
Dr. Brenda Thomas

**Call to Order**

Mr. Williamson called the meeting to order at 8:30 a.m. A quorum was present and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

**Approval of April 16, 2019 Meeting Minutes**

Mr. Williamson asked if attendees desired a reading of the minutes or if there were any corrections to the minutes? Upon hearing no requests or corrections, Mr. Williamson declared ACCEPTANCE of the April 16, 2019 meeting minutes.

**June 2019 Board Action Items:**

**Action Item #2 - Apollo Video Technology Uninterruptible Power Supply**

Ms. DesLauriers-Davis explained that this acquisition is to purchase and install Apollo Video Technology Uninterruptible Power Supplies (UPS) for Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority's (RTA) current fleet of 263 revenue vehicles, both fixed route and paratransit. The UPS is an accessory to RTA's existing Mobile Video System purchased from Apollo Video in 2016 at a cost of \$3,185,188.

Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority

1

In the event battery power to the camera system is lost, the UPS will allow the cameras to run for up to 30 additional minutes. This procurement is sole source because Apollo is the original equipment manufacturer (OEM) for RTA's video system, and only installations by Apollo's approved vendors will be covered under warranty. The procurement for UPS is being brought to the Board at this time because it supports RTA's core value of Safety for our customers and employees.

Apollo's proposed cost to equip the current fleet with the UPS is as follows:

Qty.	Description	Unit Price	Total Price
263	RRHDUPS-B HD Uninterruptible Power Supply	\$611	\$160,693
263	Installation and commissioning	113	29,719
	<b>Subtotal</b>		<b>\$190,412</b>
	Contingency for unforeseen conditions		10,000
	<b>Total</b>		<b>\$200,412</b>

With the possibility of **up to 35** additional buses going into service for the Dayton Public School service, it is recommended that the Board approve **up to** an additional \$25,340 to have this same equipment installed in these buses, if the service is approved by Dayton Public Schools.

Qty.	Description	Unit Price	Total Price
35	RRHDUPS-B HD Uninterruptible Power Supply	\$611	\$21,385
35	Installation and commissioning	113	3,955
	<b>Total</b>		<b>\$25,340</b>

This procurement will be funded with 80% Federal funds.

A cost analysis was conducted to determine if the pricing proposed by Apollo is fair and reasonable. Based on past history for the parts pricing and current rates paid for installations of this type, it was found to be fair and reasonable.

MOTION made by Mr. Hoge and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of a contract AWARD to Apollo Video Technology, LLC for Uninterruptible Power Supplies for up to \$215,752 plus a \$10,000 contingency for unforeseen conditions for a total award amount of \$225,752. Actual cost may vary based on the actual number of units purchased. Motion APPROVED by voice vote 9-0.

**Action Item #3 - Purchase of Pole Cages**

Ms. DesLauriers-Davis explained that Greater Dayton RTA is seeking bids for the purchase of pole cages for three (3) years. This project is consistent with RTA's core values of Safety, Integrity, and Stewardship as we demonstrate our commitment to improving the overhead trolley system infrastructure.

These pole cages are being manufactured to RTA's detailed specifications and are used in conjunction with the installation of the steel strain trolley poles. There are five (5) sizes of cages in this procurement.

Sealed bids for the Purchase of Pole Cages were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Invitations for Bid were sent to five (5) firms.

At 2:00 p.m. on April 30, 2019, three (3) bids were received and publicly opened. The results are as follows:

**IFB GD 19-07  
Purchase of Pole Cages**

**Owens Supply  
Plainfield, IL**

POLE CAGE TYPE - PER ATTACHED DRAWING	ESTIMATED QUANTITY - OVER PER YEAR	COST PER CAGE YEAR 1	TOTAL COST YEAR 1	COST PER CAGE YEAR 2	TOTAL COST YEAR 2	COST PER CAGE YEAR 3	TOTAL COST YEAR 3	TOTAL CONTRACT PRICE
P-4 / F-4	15	\$488	\$7,320	\$498	\$7,470	\$508	\$7,620	\$22,410
P-5 / F-5	15	265	3,975	275	4,125	285	4,275	12,375
P-6 / F-6	25	225	5,625	235	5,875	245	6,125	17,625
P-7 / F-7	85	165	14,025	175	14,875	185	15,725	44,625
P-8 / F-8	5	165	825	175	875	185	925	2,625
<b>TOTAL COST BY YEAR</b>			<b>\$31,770</b>		<b>\$33,220</b>		<b>\$34,670</b>	<b>\$99,660</b>
<b>COST PER DELIVERY TO 600 LONGWORTH STREET, DAYTON, OH 45402</b>								<b>No Charge</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL FOR POLE CAGES - 3 YEAR CONTRACT PERIOD</b>								<b>\$99,660</b>

**Becker Electric  
Dayton, OH**

POLE CAGE TYPE - PER ATTACHED DRAWING	ESTIMATED QUANTITY - OVER PER YEAR	COST PER CAGE YEAR 1	TOTAL COST YEAR 1	COST PER CAGE YEAR 2	TOTAL COST YEAR 2	COST PER CAGE YEAR 3	TOTAL COST YEAR 3	TOTAL CONTRACT PRICE
P-4 / F-4	15	\$549	\$8,235	\$619	\$9,285	\$727	\$10,905	\$28,425
P-5 / F-5	15	340	5,100	379	5,685	439	6,585	17,370
P-6 / F-6	25	233	5,825	255	6,375	290	7,250	19,450
P-7 / F-7	85	204	17,340	222	18,870	250	21,250	57,460
P-8 / F-8	5	197	985	214	1,070	240	1,200	3,255
<b>TOTAL COST BY YEAR</b>			<b>\$37,485</b>		<b>\$41,285</b>		<b>\$47,190</b>	<b>\$125,960</b>
<b>COST PER DELIVERY TO 600 LONGWORTH STREET, DAYTON, OH 45402</b>								<b>included in pole price</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL FOR POLE CAGES - 3 YEAR CONTRACT PERIOD</b>								<b>\$125,960</b>

**Arcon Builders  
Arcanum, OH**

POLE CAGE TYPE - PER ATTACHED DRAWING	ESTIMATED QUANTITY - OVER PER YEAR	COST PER CAGE YEAR 1	TOTAL COST YEAR 1	COST PER CAGE YEAR 2	TOTAL COST YEAR 2	COST PER CAGE YEAR 3	TOTAL COST YEAR 3	TOTAL CONTRACT PRICE
P-4 / F-4	15	\$675	\$10,125	\$820	\$12,300	\$1,000	\$15,000	\$37,425
P-5 / F-5	15	380	5,700	460	6,900	550	8,250	20,850
P-6 / F-6	25	260	6,500	320	8,000	390	9,750	24,250
P-7 / F-7	85	225	19,125	275	23,375	325	27,625	70,125
P-8 / F-8	5	235	1,175	290	1,450	350	1,750	4,375
<b>TOTAL COST BY YEAR</b>			<b>\$42,625</b>		<b>\$52,025</b>		<b>\$62,375</b>	<b>\$157,025</b>
<b>COST PER DELIVERY TO 600 LONGWORTH STREET, DAYTON, OH 45402</b>						<b>\$4,000</b>	<b>3 deliveries</b>	<b>\$12,000</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL FOR POLE CAGES - 3 YEAR CONTRACT PERIOD</b>								<b>\$169,025</b>

Orders were placed for cages over the past six (6) months in the amount of \$17,388. These cages will be purchased as needed and be reimbursed by FTA for 80% of the cost.

MOTION made by Mr. Corrado and SECONDED by Ms. Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of a contract AWARD to Owens Supply in the amount of \$99,660 for the purchase of pole cages for a three (3) year period, and to ratify the above amount of \$17,388 for a total amount of \$117,048. Motion APPROVED by voice vote 9-0.

**ACTION ITEM #4 Purchase, Installation, Commissioning, and Testing of Two (2) New In-ground Hoists**

Ms. DesLauriers-Davis explained that purpose of this procurement is to purchase two (2) new in-ground hoists including installation, commissioning, and testing. The project will include removal and proper disposal of the existing concrete where the hoists will be installed. This project is consistent with RTA’s core values of Safety and Stewardship as we demonstrate our commitment to maintaining safety in our facilities.

The vendor is required to provide all labor, materials, and permits to successfully complete the project.

The State of Ohio competitively bids many items which public entities may purchase without going through additional competitive procedures. The hoists, installation, commissioning, and testing is on the State of Ohio contract with Rotary Lift. Below is the State pricing that was obtained.

<b>Rotary Lift Madison, IN 47250</b>				
Item	Description	Qty.	Unit Price	Extended Price
1.	Modular movable plunger modular unit with 24’ track (Min WB-120”, Max WB-306, U Dim-60”)	2	\$51,656.71	\$103,313.42
2.	Modular stationary jack unit	2	31,131.20	62,262.40
3.	For two (2) post lift configuration – separate panel with VEC equalized with control panel in bay and remote mounted flex controls.	2	12,860.14	25,720.28
4.	Adapter kit for most low profile transit bus applications	2	5,191.10	10,382.20
5.	Installation includes labor and travel, cut concrete, excavate, hang new cassettes, tie rebar into new lift, backfill and pour concrete. Once concrete has cured will return to do the final component installation and connections to provided electrical disconnect, programming, and training.	2	39,200	78,400
	Freight prepaid by Rotary Lift			
	<b>Grand Total</b>			<b>\$280,078.30</b>

This will be funded with 80% Federal grant funds.

MOTION made by Ms. Hairston and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of a contract AWARD to Rotary Lift for the purchase, installation, testing, and commissioning of two in-ground hoists in the amount of \$280,078 plus a 10% contingency to cover unforeseen situations for \$28,008 for a grand total to be awarded of \$308,086. Motion APPROVED by voice vote 9-0.

**Action Item #5 – Revised Human Resources Policy #6, Equal Employment Opportunity**

Ms. Stanforth explained that this policy relays the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority's (RTA) commitment that all employment actions are administered without regard to race, color, religion, national origin, sex, age, genetic information, disability, veteran status or other protected class.

The Policy has been updated to reflect Federal Transit Administration program requirements. A newly required Chief Executive Officer Policy Statement was also attached.

MOTION made by Mr. Hoge and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of updating, as attached, Revised Human Resources Policy #6, Equal Employment Opportunity, which may include amendments following review and recommendation by RTA's Legal Counsel, prior to the June 4, 2019 Board meeting. Motion APPROVED by voice vote 9-0.

**Action item #6 - Revised Human Resources Policy #11, Self-Insured Retiree Survivor Benefit**

Ms. Stanforth explained that this policy provides a survivor benefit to certain retired employees of the Greater Dayton RTA. Benefits are paid from the Employee's Self-Insured Death Benefit Plan which is maintained in an Irrevocable Trust Agreement.

The Policy has been updated to reflect years of service requirements as detailed in the current Amalgamated Transit Union, Local #1385, Labor Agreement. The first four (4) bullet points have been updated to reflect 15 years of continuous service, as opposed to the previously stated 17 years of continuous service.

MOTION made by Ms. Heard and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of updating, as attached, Human Resources Policy #11, Self-Insured Retiree Survivor Benefit. Motion APPROVED by voice vote 9-0.

**Action Item #7 - MIS Policy #4 – Open Data & Application Programming Interfaces**

Mr. Harrington explained that it is the mission of the Greater Dayton RTA to provide great value, dependable service, and to be responsive, timely and accountable for all that we do. RTA is committed to increasing transparency, efficiency, public engagement, and supporting technological innovation and economic growth.

Open data and Application Programming Interfaces (APIs) are important as the RTA faces the critical challenge to plan and deliver a comprehensive, high-performing multimodal mobility network with the introduction of shared mobility services and technologies.

Through the thoughtful implementation of this Open Data and API Policy, RTA can improve the provision of services, increase transparency and access to public information, and enhance coordination and efficiencies among all mobility service and technology providers, partner organizations both private and public, along with the citizens of this region.

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Ms. Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of adopting, as attached, MIS Policy #4, Open Data & Application Programming Interfaces. Motion APPROVED by voice vote 9-0.

**Action Item #8 - Dayton Public School Service – Vehicle Equipment Needs**

Ms. DesLauriers-Davis explained that this action Item is being brought to the Board of Trustees contingent upon the Dayton Public School Board (DPS) approving a contract for student bus service with the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA). It has been estimated that this proposed service will require up to 35 additional buses. Staff has determined that the one-time costs, involving multiple vendors, to restore up to 35 buses to meet the potential vehicle needs for this proposed service is estimated at \$800,000. The majority of this estimated cost is for on-board electronic systems such as Radios, CAD/AVL, Cameras, DVRs and Modems, and other equipment necessary to restore the buses back into normal operating condition.

Although a contract with DPS has not yet been negotiated, the cost of the bus service will be reimbursed.

MOTION made by Ms. Heard and SECONDED by Ms. Howard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of funding, not to exceed \$800,000 plus a 10% contingency for a total of \$880,000 to restore up to 35 buses to normal operating condition for this proposed service. The Board approval is contingent upon the RTA securing a contract with the Dayton Public School Board for student bus service. Motion APPROVED by voice vote 9-0.

**Action Item # 9 -Transit Mobility-as-a-Service (MaaS) Pilot Program**

Mr. Policicchio explained that in October 2018, Greater Dayton RTA Board Trustees approved a sole source five (5) year strategic partnership agreement with 9280-0366 Quebec Inc. (*Transit*), a multimodal trip planning app company. RTA has been working with Transit on the planning and proposed implementation to pilot and launch a fully functional Mobility-as-a-Service (MaaS) platform for the region. The platform will allow for the phased integration of various mobility components, such as fixed route, paratransit, on-demand, human service transportation, bike share, taxi, transit network companies (TNC), car-share, scooters and other forms of shared mobility. It is also understood that RTA's fare payment system vendor, Masabi, will work exclusively with Transit in order to deliver the fully functional MaaS platform.

This action item aligns with RTA core values of Quality Service and Stewardship and moves us towards blurring the lines of mobility into one seamless, integrated network of services that enhances the customer experience for all.

RTA worked with Transit, Masabi, and other partners to develop an individual, yet beneficial and aligned incentive revenue sharing model and budget aimed to reduce RTA's current annual operating

and capitalized maintenance costs. All integrations and associated pricing are dependent on Application Program Interface (API) access in line with the requirements of RTA and Transit. Operational expenses begin when the project segment(s) are mutually agreed to be ready to launch. Operational expenses include on-going maintenance support for bug fixes and incremental feature releases, working closely with RTA to ensure that issues are resolved. Capital expenditures are due when development is complete and are one-time costs.

The following is estimated pricing to launch a fully functional MaaS platform for the region broken into two segments: (1) the multimodal consumer application; and (2) integration of RTA's fare payment system vendor, Masabi, and RTA's current and projected operated services.

	Ongoing Costs (Operating)	Development Costs (Capital)	Revenue Share
<b>Segment 1: Multimodal Consumer App</b>			
Maintenance, Reporting, Data Warehousing	\$60,000		
<b>Segment 2: Payment Integration</b>			
Integrate Masabi Pay-as-you-go	\$198,000	\$110,000	1%
Implement Masabi Stored Value	\$120,000	\$90,000	
Payment - Operator Services (ex. Bike and Scooter Share)	\$30,000		10%
<b>Five Year Total Project Cost (2019 – 2023)</b>	<b>\$408,000</b>	<b>\$200,000</b>	<b>Est. \$550,000*</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>			<b>\$1,158,000*</b>

\* Includes funds for Innovation and Bundle Development as well as flat credit card handling per transaction (security) for tokenizing credit cards in order to maintain Payment Card Industry (PCI) compliance. Transit is charged \$0.04 for each credit card sent to Masabi from Transit on behalf of RTA. Any increase or decrease will be passed through.

### Pricing Descriptions

#### Segment 1: Multimodal Consumer App

Full public transit integration, on-going development and feature support, data warehousing for storing RTA's usage information, access to a real-time dashboard for the agency to view information on how the app is being used, the types of trips being searched for and clicked, etc.

#### Segment 2: Payments

- Integrate Masabi Pay-Per-Ride – Implementation costs, maintenance and revenue share for seamless payment through the app.
- Integrate Masabi Stored-Value – Implementing a stored value payment solution for RTA within Transit, on-going development and feature support.
- Integrate Other Operated Services – Implementing a bike or scooter share payment integration to allow for bike and/or scooter share purchases.

### Future Investments

RTA estimates that in order to fully deploy the MaaS platform with Transit app, additional future investments of up to \$2,900,000 may be required. This includes Transit, RTA and other mobility provider(s) software integration costs related to deploying multimodal connections/programs, paratransit, human service, first and last mile, shared micromobility and microtransit services, and MaaS Web-Based Application Development. Integrations may include but are not limited to Trapeze, GoRide, 5310 recipient software systems, and other shared ride technology platforms integrated with fixed-route and other RTA services such as Connect Coordination, On-Demand, Paratransit and Premium Services.

MOTION made by Mr. Hoge and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of a contract AWARD to 9280-0366 Quebec Inc. (Transit) for an estimated five-year total project cost (Segments 1-2) not to exceed \$1,158,000. All integrations and associated expenses are dependent on open data and API access in line with the requirements of RTA and Transit. Actual ongoing variable costs will depend on the fares sold through Transit. Execution of these and future expenditures are dependent upon receipt of future capital and operating funding, which will be identified and allocated within RTA's current and future budgets. RTA will also actively seek and apply for federal and state grant opportunities to fully fund these future investments. Motion APPROVED by voice vote 9-0.

**Informational and Discussion Items:**

**Customer and Business Development Update**

Mr. Policicchio stated the Customer and Business Development Department previously included in today's meeting packet a summary document of recent activities. Activities to mention include:

- The Flyer Service Update
- 2019 American Bus Benchmarking Group (ABBG) Survey
- What Drives You Campaign Update
- GoRide Partnership Launch
- RTA Staff News and Recognition

**KPI Data Review**

Ms. Beard stated the KPI data was placed around the table today. Ms. Beard highlighted specific information related to the reports including: On-Time Performance, Passenger Boardings per Revenue Hour, Employee Unplanned Absenteeism, Road Calls and Preventable Collisions.

**February 2019 Sales Tax Update**

Ms. Beard stated February 2019 Sales Tax receipts equal \$2.9 million.

- Receipts **exceed February 2018** by \$55,000 or 1.9%.
- Receipts **exceed February 2019 budget** by \$35,000 or 1.2%.

Year-to-Date (YTD) February 2019 Sales Tax receipts equal \$5.7 million.

- Receipts **exceed YTD February 2018** by \$146,000 or 2.6%.
- Receipts **exceed YTD February 2019 budget** by \$130,000 or 2.3%.



**April 2019 Financial Statements**

Ms. Beard reported for the month of April 2019 RTA's Net Gain after Local Depreciation is \$46,000 compared to a Budgeted Net Loss of 176,000. Operating revenues were \$61,000 above budget and operating expenses, excluding depreciation were \$130,000 under budget. RTA Local depreciation expense was \$74,000 over budget while non-operating revenues were \$105,000 better than budget.

RTA's YTD April 2019 Net Loss after Local Depreciation is \$726,000 compared to YTD Budgeted Net Loss of \$1.6 million. Operating revenues were \$75,000 above budget and operating expenses, excluding depreciation were \$497,000 under budget. RTA Local depreciation expense was \$127,000 over budget while non-operating revenues were \$430,000 better than budget.

The details and variance explanations associated with the financial statements are included in today's Committees Meeting Package. Today's financial report was very positive!

**Operating and Capital Acquisition Schedules**

Ms. Howard stated the Operating and Capital Acquisition Schedules were placed around the table today. There were no questions or comments from Committees members regarding the Schedules.

**Small Purchasing Information**

Ms. Howard stated Small Purchasing Information was previously included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions from Committees members regarding this report.

**Next Meeting Dates**

A Jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting will be held on July 16, 2019 and August 20, 2019.

**Adjournment**

Mr. Williamson DECLARED the meeting ADJOURNED. The meeting adjourned at 10:29 a.m.

**Attest**



**David Williamson, Chair**



**Brandon Policicchio, Committee Secretary**