

Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes

July 20, 2021

Members Present:

Vince Corrado

Al Fullenkamp Sharon Hairston Adrienne Heard

Belinda Matthews Stenson

Tom U. Weckesser David Williamson

Excused Absence:

Sharon Howard

John Lumpkin

Staff in Attendance:

Bob Ruzinsky

Chris Cole Daron Brown

Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall Co., L.P.A.

Brandon Policicchio Mary Stanforth Brenda Thomas

Call to Order

Mr. Williamson called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m. A quorum was present and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of May 18, 2021 Meeting Minutes

Mr. Williamson asked if attendees desired a reading of the minutes or if there were any corrections to the minutes? Upon hearing no requests or corrections, Mr. Williamson declared ACCEPTANCE of the May 18, 2021 meeting minutes.

August 2021 Board Action Items:

Action Item #2 - Maintenance Uniforms - Rental and Cleaning Services

Mr. Brown stated that the purpose of this procurement is for Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) to contract with a company that can provide and clean all of the uniform items for the maintenance employees. The RTA Maintenance Department employees are an integral part of the RTA. They are often in the public view, and it is important to RTA that they portray a clean and professional appearance at all times. Employees of the Maintenance Department are required to wear the uniform supplied by the Authority while on Authority paid time and working on Authority equipment, facilities, or property. This procurement demonstrates our core value of Stewardship by recognizing the high standards of the appearance of the people entrusted to our care. Approximately 130 full-time maintenance employees (including RTA Hourly Maintenance Employees and Material Control Specialists) shall be entitled to receive uniforms.

Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority













The Authority will provide employees with a basic uniform that consists of the following:

- Eleven (11) pairs of slacks with high-visibility striping, either poly/cotton or 100% cotton.
- Eleven (11) shirts with high-visibility striping, either poly/cotton or 100% cotton.
- Two (2) jackets with high-visibility striping.
- Employees in Safety Sensitive Electrical positions (approximately 31 employees) will wear Fire-Resistant (FR) uniforms with FR high-visibility striping.
- Electrical Worker Safety Kits will be provided to employees in the Line Shop (12 employees plus two (2) spares).

Proposals for Maintenance Uniforms - Rental and Cleaning for a five-year period were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, the Dayton Weekly, and Transit Talent. Requests for Proposals were sent to twelve (12) vendors.

At 10:00 a.m. on April 28, 2021, one proposal was received.

Cintas Corporation Dayton, OH

The pricing received is as follows:

Cintas Dayton, OH								
DESCRIPTION	Vendor Item #	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5		
UNIFORMS								
With Enhanced Visibility reflective								
striping								
WORK SHIRT -To be available in					-	-		
short sleeve or long sleeve;								
Poly/Cotton	59935	0.240	0.240	0.240	0.240	0.240		
WORK SHIRT - To be available in								
short sleeve or long sleeve/ 100%								
Cotton	59330	0.486	0.486	0.486	0.486	0.486		
WORK PANTS – POLY/COTTON	59945	0.209	0.209	0.209	0.209	0.209		
WORK PANTS – 100% COTTON	59340	0.482	0.482	0.482	0.482	0.482		
WORK PANTS – JEAN-CUT	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
WORK PANTS – Women's Half								
Elastic	390/395	0.209	0.209	0.209	0.209	0.209		
HIP LENGTH JACKET	59970	0.855	0.855	0.855	0.855	0.855		
OPTIONAL TEAM JACKET	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
OPTIONAL CARGO WORK PANTS						- 11 - 3		
– POLY/COTTON	270	0.350	0.350	0.350	0.350	0.350		
OPTIONAL CARGO WORK PANTS								
- 100% COTTON	TBD	0.800	0.800	0.800	0.800	0.800		

FIRE-RESISTANT (FR) CLOTHING	A i		į.	Te E		<u> </u>
With Enhanced Visibility reflective						
striping						
FR JACKET	9585	1,191	1.191	1.191	1.191	1.191
FR COTTON PANT	63685	0.482	0.482	0.482	0.482	0.482
FR SHIRT CARHART	63680	0.486	0.486	0.486	0.486	0.482
FR JACKET LINER (No enhanced	03000	0.400	0.780	0.480	0.400	0.480
Visibility striping)	64356	0.916	0.916	0.916	0.916	0.916
CARHART FR FEATHERWEIGHT			3,7,20	- 0.2 10	0.510	0.510
PANTS	73478	0.442	0.442	0.442	0.442	0.442
CARHART FR FEATHERWEIGHT SHIRT	59392	0.437	0.437	0.437	0.437	0.437
CARHART FR SWING JACKET	74634	2.500	2.500	2.500	2.500	2,500
CARHART FR BIB	78150	2.500	2.500	2.500	2.500	
O. Maliter TR DID	70130	2.300	2.300	2.300	2.300	2.500
ELECTRICAL WORKER SAFETY KIT						
	754910					
ARC GUARD FR KNIT GLOVE	300	0.860	0.860	0.860	0.860	0.860
	601960	:				0.000
CANVAS GLOVE BAG	600	0.580	0.580	0.580	0.580	0.580
11" CLASS 0 RUBBER						
INSULATING GLOVES(x3	869330					
red/black/yellow)	700	6.900	6.900	6.900	6.900	6.900
12" LEATHER PROTECTORS	869390	0.770	0.550	0.770	0	
12 CAL PUREVIEW FACE	453190	0.770	0.770	0.770	0.770	0.770
SHIELD/hard hat and neck shroud	200	4.990	4.990	4.990	4.990	4.000
STITLED/Hard hat and neek smodd	744370	4.330	4.990	4.990	4.990	4.990
ELECTRIC GEAR BAG	260	0.780	0.780	0.780	0.780	0.780
			347.55	- 0,700	0.700	0.700
REPLACEMENT/INSURANCE COST*						
Work Shirt, 65/35, Short or Long		35.00/	35.00/	35.00/	35.00/	35.00/
Sleeves, Enhanced Vis.	59935	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
Work Shirt, 100% Cotton, Short or		40.00/	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/
Long Sleeves, Enhanced Vis.	59330	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
World Donto (5/25 D. 1		35.00/	35.00/	35.00/	35.00/	35.00/
Work Pants, 65/35, Enhanced Vis.	59945	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
Work Pants, 100% Cotton, Enhanced Vis.	50240	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/
A 12·	59340	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
	Not Availab				1	
Work Pants, Jean Cut, Enhanced Vis.	le	/	,	,	,	,
					/	/

Work Pants, Women's Half Elastic,		40.00/	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/	1000/
Enhanced Vis.	390/395	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	40.00/
	370/373	55.00/	55.00/	55.00/	55.00/	\$.10
Hip Length Jacket, Enhanced Vis.	59970	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	55.00/
	Not	ψ.10	Φ.10	φ.10	Φ.ΤΟ	\$.10
	Availab				L.	
Optional Team Jacket, Enhanced Vis.	le	I	,	 	,	,
Optional Cargo Work Pants, 65/35,	270	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/	40.00/
Enhanced Vis.	custom	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
Optional Cargo Work Pants, 100%	Custoni	55.00/	55.00/	55.00/	55.00/	55.00/
Cotton, Enhanced Vis.	TBD	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
	TDD	95.00/	95.00/	95.00/	95.00/	95.00/
FR Jacket, Enhanced Vis.	9585	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	2005	75.00/	75.00/	75.00/	75.00/	75.00/
FR Cotton Pant, Enhanced Vis.	63685	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	03003	75.00/	75.00/	75.00/	75.00/	75.00/
FR Shirt, Carhart, Enhanced Vis.	63680	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
, and the second	03000	125.00	125.00	125.00	125.00	
FR Jacket Liner	64356	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	125.00
FR Carhart Featherweight Pants,	01330	129.00	129.00	129.00	129.00	/\$.10
Enhanced Vis.	73478	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	129.00
FR Carhart Featherweight Shirt,	73470	102.00	102.00	102.00	102.00	/\$.10
Enhanced Vis.	59392	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	102.00
FR Carhart Swing Jacket, Enhanced	37372	260.00	260.00	260.00	260.00	/\$.10
Vis.	74634	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	260.00
	77057	300.00	300.00	300.00	300.00	/\$.10
FR Carhart Bib, Enhanced Vis.	78150	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10		300.00
Electrical Worker Safety Kit	70150	/φ.10	/φ.10	/\$.1U	/\$.10	/\$.10
Electrical Worker Salety Kit	754010	00 417	20.41/	22 44 /	20 11 /	
ARC Guard FR Knit Glove-only	754910	22.41/	22.41/	22.41/	22.41/	22.41/
Aice Guard FR Kint Glove-only	300	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
Canvas Glove Bag-only	601960	21.63/	21.63/	21.63/	21.63/	21.63/
11" Class 0 Rubber Insulating Gloves	600	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
(x3 red/black/yellow)-only	869330	63.39/	63.39/	63.39/	63.39/	63.39/
(X3 Ted/Diack/yellow)-only	700	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
12" Leather Protectors and	869390	21.63/	21.63/	21.63/	21.63/	21.63/
12" Leather Protectors-only	000	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10
12 Cal Pureview Face Shield/hard hat	453190	169.00	169.00	169.00	169.00	169.00
and neck shroud-only	200	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10	/\$.10
Fleatria Goar Pog and	744370	30.91/	30.91/	30.91/	30.91/	30.91/
Electric Gear Bag-only	260	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10	\$.10

^{*} Insurance covers fire, paint, oil, rips and tears, unusual wear and tear, even if sleeves are cut off a shirt. Loss and theft are not covered.

Analysis of the pricing received from Cintas showed that the prices for the uniforms (non-fire resistant) stayed the same as the last multi-year contract, except for all cotton items. The all-cotton

pieces rose in price from 46% to 62% due to the rise in the cotton market. The all-cotton treated fire resistant uniforms, bib overalls and electrical safety kits are new to this contract. The prices between Cintas' contract years stayed the same. For these reasons, Cintas' pricing was determined fair and reasonable.

The bid list was polled to find out why only one vendor bid. It was found that one vendor did not have their sample uniform items ready to submit; one vendor said he would first have to scale up and purchase the uniforms to rent, and he is not at a point where he is interested in doing that; and one said that they do not cover the Dayton area.

Estimated expenditures per year, including insurance, are as follows. The totals include a 5% contingency for lost or not returned items not covered by insurance.

Contract Year	Estimated Total		
Year 1	\$114,550		
Year 2	114,550		
Year 3	114,550		
Year 4	114,550		
Year 5	114,550		
GRAND TOTAL	\$572,750		

Maintenance Uniforms will be paid for with operating funds.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Cintas for the rental and cleaning of Maintenance Uniforms in the estimated amount of \$114,550 per year for five years, for a total estimated amount of \$572,750. Actual expenditures will vary based on usage.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote of 7-0.

Action Item #3 - Overhead Infrastructure Parts

Mr. Brown explained that the purpose of this procurement is to obtain Overhead Infrastructure Parts for the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA). The parts are necessary for the 601 Building, 600 Longworth Campus, 8N Salem Phase 1 electric trolleybus Overhead Infrastructure projects, and miscellaneous inventory. This project is consistent with RTA's core values of Quality Service and Stewardship by maintaining and improving our trolley system infrastructure, capabilities, and facilities. By continuously improving our infrastructure and facilities, we exhibit our dedication to the community and customers.

601 Building – new feeder wire and spacer bar segments will be installed throughout the parking areas to allow the NexGen fleet to be charged in this building. This work also coincides with the new substation that is being installed just outside the 601 building.

600 Longworth Campus – the trolley wire around the 600 Longworth facility is being updated and redesigned due to age/wear as well as utilizing the capabilities of the NexGen fleet.

8N Salem Phase 1 – the city is rebuilding sections of Salem Ave. These parts are needed for the Phase 1 installation from North Salem to Manhattan Avenue.

The successful bidder(s) will be required to provide necessary parts for the 601 Building, 600 Longworth Campus, 8N Salem Phase 1 electric trolleybus overhead infrastructure projects, and miscellaneous inventory. The list of 44 items was sent out to prospective vendors with estimated quantities required for each item.

Sealed bids for the Overhead Infrastructure Parts were solicited through the Dayton Daily News, Dayton Weekly, and Transit Talent. Invitations for bids were sent to five (5) bidders.

At 2:00 P.M. on May 21, 2021, three (3) bids were received and publicly opened. The results are attached.

An award under small purchasing will be made to Mac Products, Inc. for bid line item 23, totaling \$9,299.54.

Phoenix Mining shall be awarded line items 1-22 and 24-44, totaling \$284,725.

This procurement will be partially funded with Federal grant funds.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Corrado that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Phoenix Mining in the amount of \$284,725.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #4 - Engine Lubricating Oil

Mr. Brown explained that the purpose of this procurement is to purchase engine lubricating oil for the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) for the diesel fleet. Engine lubricating oil is used daily by the Maintenance Department as part of preventive maintenance. This project is consistent with RTA's core values of Safety and Stewardship as we continuously work to maintain RTA's fleet in excellent condition.

The successful bidder will be required to deliver approximately 9,000 gallons of engine lubricating oil per year.

On June 29, 2021, sealed bids for the Purchase of Engine Lubricating Oil were solicited through <u>Dayton Daily News</u>, <u>Dayton Weekly News</u>, and <u>Transit Talent</u>. Invitations for Bid were sent to twenty-seven (27) vendors.

At 2:00 P.M. on June 29, 2021, four (4) bids were received and publicly opened. The results are as follows:

	Est. Usage (Gallons)	Unit Price per Gallon	Total	Unit Price per Gallon	Total	Unit Price per Gallon	Total	Unit Price per Gallon	Total
Year One	9,000	\$6.49	\$58,410.00	\$7.75	\$69,750.00	\$8.73	\$78,570.00	\$7.91	
Year Two	9,000	\$6.74	\$60,660.00	\$8.00	\$72,000,00	\$9.39	\$84,510.00		7. /===:=
Year Three	9,000	\$6.99	\$62,910.00	\$8.25	\$74,250.00	\$10.25	\$92,250.00	No Bid	
	Total		\$181,980.00	#*************************************	\$216,000.00	!	\$255,330.00		\$71,190.00
Manufacturer		She	ell	Pinnacle Oi	l Company	Valvo	oline	Nu-Tie	er Gulf
Product Name		T2 HD 1	15W40	Tech Select	CK-4 15W40	All-Terrain En 15W40, p/n 8	•	Gulf Super Du	ty Plus 15W40

^{*}R.D. Holder Oll Co., Inc. was determined Non-Responsive.

This procurement will be funded with operating funds.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Apollo Oil for Engine Lubricating Oil based on estimated usage of 9,000 gallons per year for three (3) years for a total of \$181,980.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #5 - Long Term Disability Insurance

Ms. Thomas explained that the purpose of this procurement is to obtain coverage for Long Term Disability Insurance for full-time non-union employees, full-time hourly employees represented by the American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees (AFSCME), and full-time employees represented by the Amalgamated Transit Union (ATU). This project is consistent with RTA's Core Value, Stewardship, where we manage our time, talent, and resources efficiently and responsibly.

The Long Term Disability (LTD) coverage currently provides a minimum benefit of \$50 up to a cap of \$5,000 per month to all eligible full-time employees. This LTD coverage is contributory and is an optional benefit. Employees choosing this benefit currently contribute forty percent (40%) of the monthly premium cost. The successful contractor will be responsible for processing claims, providing claims reports, plan documents, necessary communication materials, and administrative materials and supplies.

Proposals for LTD Insurance were solicited through the <u>Dayton Daily News</u> and the <u>Dayton Weekly</u> <u>News</u>. Requests for proposals were sent to 20 firms.

At 2:00 p.m. on May 13, 2021, two (2) proposals were received. The final results are as follows:

Firm	Annualized*	Term	Total	
Hartford Life & Accident Insurance Co.	\$132,444	Three Year Rate	\$397,332	
Hartford, CT				
Ochs (Madison Natl. Life Ins. Co., Inc.)	**	**	**	
St. Paul, MN				

* Annualized estimate is based on the census during Request for Proposal.

** FTA requires only the successful Proposer's pricing be publicly disclosed.

The new cost of the LTD Insurance represents a 53% decrease over the current plan and an increase in the cap to \$7,500 per month to all eligible full-time employees.

This expense is being funded through RTA's Operating budget.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Hartford Life & Accident Insurance Co. for a three (3) year period for Long Term Disability Insurance at an estimated annual cost of \$132,444 for a total of \$397,332. The annualized estimate is based on the census during the Request for Proposal.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #6 - Transit Fare Structure Adjustments

Mr. Policicchio explained that after review of the current Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) fare structure following the completion of implementing RTA's new fare payment system Tapp Pay, recommendations have been made to revise the types of fare payments accepted on-board all vehicles.

Prior to making these recommendations, RTA conducted a customer survey and public hearings, along with a Title VI – Fare Equity Analysis. The completed analysis is included with this action item.

MOTION made by Ms. Hairston and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees ADOPTION of the revised RTA Fare Structure Tariff included with this action item, to be effective Monday, November 1, 2021. Furthermore, that the Chief Executive Officer be authorized to do all things necessary to implement the new fare structure.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

<u>Action Item #7 – July 2021 Title VI Fare Equity Analysis for New Payment System & Proposed Fare Changes</u>

Mr. Policicchio explained that as a recipient of U.S. Department of Transportation (USDOT), Federal Transit Administration (FTA) funding, the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) must comply with Title VI and Environmental Justice regulations. This is to insure that RTA provides fair and equitable service and amenities delivery and installation, meaningful customer outreach plans, and periodic service/fare equity review processes.

While RTA is in compliance with the FTA Title VI program through November 30, 2021 it is required that the RTA Board of Trustees review and approve the RTA Title VI Fare Equity Analysis.

The RTA is requesting the RTA Board of Trustees review and gives approval to submit the July 2021 Title VI – Fare Equity Analysis for New Payment System & Proposed Fare Changes, which will be included in the next Title VI Program update to the TEAM FTA website.

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees APPROVAL of the July 2021 Title VI – Fare Equity Analysis for New Payment System & Proposed Fare Changes, since the last submittal on October 24, 2018.

Motion APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Informational and Discussion Items:

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio previously included in today's meeting packet a summary document of recent activities in the Customer and Business Development Department. Activities to mention include:

- Tapp Pay
- July Bus
- Vaccination Support Efforts
- Travel Training
- Ad Recruitment Efforts
- Website Redesign Project Update
- Community Relations Report

Financial Report

Ms. Stanforth reported year-to-date June 2021 indicates a gain of \$4.2 million after capital and GASB charges. The positive result will allow a smoother economic recovery over the next couple of years.

Passenger fares are 19% lower than last year and 18% lower than current year budget as a result of COVID. Federal assistance includes CARES Act funding which allows RTA to provide comprehensive service and provides a set aside of sales tax for future operations. Total Revenues are \$405k above budget due to higher than expected sales tax and federal assistance offset by lower passenger revenues. Total Expenses are \$3.7 million lower than budget. Employee wages & fringe benefits, contract services, diesel fuel and materials & supplies are the major contributors. On a monthly basis we are consistently spending less than budget in these categories.

After three months of Sales Tax Receipts for 2021, we are up \$1.57 million over 2020 and up \$1.49 million over 2021 budget.

Ms. Stanforth stated the 2020 Audit Report was previously included in today's meeting packet. The audit received an Unqualified Opinion and there were no deficiencies or findings. The Committees congratulated Ms. Stanforth on the clean report.

Small Purchasing Information and Operating & Capital Acquisition Schedules

Ms. Stanforth stated the Small Purchasing Information and Acquisition Schedules were previously included in today's meeting packet. There were no questions from the Committees.

Executive Session

At 9:57 a.m. Mr. Williamson made a motion, seconded by Ms. Hairston to enter into executive session to discuss preparations for bargaining sessions with public employees concerning terms and conditions of employment.

At 10:41 a.m. Mr. Williamson made a motion, seconded by Ms. Matthews Stenson to exit the executive session.

Next Meeting Dates

A Jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting will be held on August 17 and September 21, 2021.

Adjournment

Hearing no objections, Mr. Williamson DECLARED the meeting ADJOURNED. The meeting adjourned at 10:42 a.m.

Attest

David Williamson, Acting Chair

Brandon Policicchio, Committee Secretary